

SUBJECT: GAVI 5.0: MEASUREMENT FRAMEWORK/STRATEGY INDICATORS

Agenda item: 02

Category: For Guidance

Section A: Executive Summary

Purpose of the report

Following discussions at the October 2019 and May 2020 Programme and Policy Committee (PPC) meetings, the Board is requested to provide guidance on the Gavi 5.0 measurement framework. An Alliance Technical Working Group (TWG) is advising on development of the framework and ensuring alignment with Immunization Agenda 2030 (IA2030). An iterative process with broad consultations to vet indicators has included consultations with countries, partners, Civil Society Organisations and other Alliance stakeholders at the Gavi 5.0 Countries and Partners Retreat.

Questions this paper addresses

- How is the 5.0 measurement framework being developed?
- Which indicators are currently suggested for 5.0 strategy performance monitoring, at which levels, and which require further development?
- How does the COVID-19 pandemic affect finalisation of the 5.0 measurement framework?

The COVID-19 pandemic will delay finalisation of the 5.0 measurement framework, largely due to the challenge of setting targets given uncertain 2020 baselines.

Section B: Gavi 5.0: Measurement Framework/Strategy Indicators

1. Facts and Data

- 1.1 Proposed Gavi 5.0 mission and strategy indicators are intended to measure progress towards the goals and objectives as described in the Gavi 5.0 strategy framework “one-pager” (Annex A), approved by the Board in June 2019. They focus on key portfolio-level impacts, outcomes or outputs, with shared accountability across the Alliance. They represent a subset of the metrics to be used for monitoring progress along Gavi’s result chain.
- 1.2 The following principles guide the development of Strategy Performance Monitoring (details provided in Doc 06 to the October 2019 PPC meeting):

- a) Measurement focus on the causal pathway to achieving Gavi 5.0 strategic goals.
 - b) Measurement for shared accountability that facilitates performance management, with an emphasis on informative, timely data.
 - c) Alliance ownership of strategy goals, objectives, indicators and targets.
- 1.3 Indicator development emphasises connecting indicators to the design of the Gavi 2021-2025 strategy. The Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) team has worked with Secretariat programme teams, in consultation with Alliance stakeholders, to think through theories of change to identify the outputs or outcomes that must be measured to understand progress towards the Strategy Goals. Consultations during the Gavi 5.0 Countries and Partners Retreat on 25-27 February 2020 provided useful guidance on potential indicators. A TWG of M&E specialists, including representatives from core Alliance partners, reviews indicators and continues to advise the Secretariat. Considerable membership overlap between the TWG and the IA 2030 M&E Taskforce helps ensure alignment with IA 2030 indicators.
- 1.4 The PPC welcomed and emphasised the importance of aligning the measurement frameworks of Gavi 5.0 and IA 2030.
- 1.5 This paper describes current proposals for a subset of Gavi 5.0 mission and strategy indicators for Board guidance. These are summarised in a dashboard in Annex B and tables in Annex C, with technical details provided in Appendix 1. Strategy Goal 3 (Improve sustainability of immunisation programmes) indicators are pending decisions on the Funding Policy Review and Gavi's approach to engagement with former and never-eligible Middle-Income Countries (see Doc 03 to 24-25 June 2020 Board meeting).

2. COVID-19 and the Gavi 5.0 measurement framework

- 2.1 The onset of the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in less consultation on Gavi 5.0 indicator development than originally planned. As progress-to-date focused on defining indicators core to Gavi's mission, most of the indicators proposed here likely remain relevant for measuring Gavi 5.0 performance. Additional indicators may be required to monitor Gavi's response to COVID-19 at the request of the Gavi Board.
- 2.2 Potential delays in setting targets for Gavi 5.0 strategy indicators are anticipated due to COVID-19 disruptions. If disruptions to immunisation services are significant, selection of baseline values (e.g. for 2020) will be challenging this year, particularly as WUENIC estimates for quantifying the full effects on immunisation coverage will not be available until July 2021.
- 2.3 It is possible that finalising a small number of strategy indicators could be delayed into 2021 where policy development is affected by COVID-19, such as Strategy Goal 3 related to the Funding Policy Review (see Doc 03 to 24-25 June 2020 Board meeting).

- 2.4 The PPC indicated that extending timelines was appropriate, but that new timelines must be established and adhered to. The PPC also suggested that Gavi work with the Global Fund and the Global Financing Facility on developing an indicator to measure COVID-19 response efforts.

3. Mission Indicators

- 3.1 As outlined in the Gavi 5.0 strategy framework, Gavi's vision is to "leave no one behind with immunisation" and to "save lives and protect people's health by increasing coverage and equitable use of vaccines". The mission indicators are intended to measure progress on these overall goals, demonstrate Gavi's global impact and enable advocacy. Some are tied to commitments in the Gavi 2021-2025 Investment Opportunity. We propose 6 mission indicators (see Annexes B and C).
- 3.2 Four proposed mission indicators: *under-five mortality rate (M1)*, *future deaths (M2) and DALYs (M3) averted*, and *economic benefits unlocked (M6)*, are well-established impact indicators named in the Gavi 5.0 strategy framework and consistent with previous definitions (i.e. in Gavi 4.0).
- 3.3 For the "*Equity indicator*" (M4), we propose an indicator of the *number of zero-dose children*. There is agreement within the TWG and for IA2030 that "zero-dose" will be defined as children lacking the first dose of diphtheria, tetanus, and pertussis- (DTP-) containing vaccine, as a simple measure of the reach of routine immunisation services. This will likely be formulated as *the reduction in the number of zero-dose children*.
- 3.4 One additional mission indicator is recommended, "*unique children immunised with Gavi support*" (M5), defined as the number of children immunised with the last recommended dose of at least one Gavi-supported vaccine delivered through routine systems. This long-standing Gavi mission indicator features prominently in the 2021-2025 Investment Opportunity, with a commitment to reach another 300 million children.
- 3.5 Based on feedback from the TWG, PPC and participants of the Gavi 5.0 Countries and Partners Retreat, we recommend removing the two mission indicators in the Gavi 5.0 strategy framework: "*People (male & female) vaccinated with Gavi support across the life course*" and "*People (male & female) vaccinated with Gavi support against outbreak-prone diseases.*" These indicators proved difficult to operationalise and interpret in relation to other mission indicators. It is noted that people are not vaccinated over the life course in one year, and setting targets for the total number immunised against out-break prone diseases is challenging in the context of preventive campaigns and outbreak response. One option for measuring these concepts is to sum the total number of completed immunisations (as opposed to unique individuals). This approach, along with suggestions from the PPC, may be refined for use beyond mission and strategy indicators.
- 3.6 Some members of the PPC suggested elevating the four Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 3.b.1 indicators (DTP3, PCV3, MCV2, and HPV coverage) to Mission level to signal SDG alignment and measure

immunisation over the lifecourse. Currently, these SDG indicators are included within Strategic Goal 1 as they are drivers of breadth of protection (see Section 4.3). This substitution would expand the number mission indicators to 10, more than double the number from Gavi 4.0. While signalling SDG alignment is important, the Secretariat is concerned these indicators do lend themselves to simple statements about Gavi's impact, hence the suggestion to retain these at strategy level. The Secretariat will continue to discuss with partners, including through the IA2030 M&E Taskforce, about how best to communicate progress on SDG 3.b.1.

- 3.7 Previous consultations, including a PPC member, recommended potential inclusion of a mission-level indicator on sustainability. For example, *Vaccines sustained after Gavi support ends* has been used in Gavi 4.0.

4. SG1 1 – Introduce and scale up vaccines

- 4.1 Under Strategy Goal 1 (SG1), the Alliance aims to continue supporting introductions and scale-up of coverage of high-impact vaccines in eligible countries. We propose structuring measurement towards this goal with indicators of breadth of protection through routine immunisation, reach of preventive campaigns and timeliness of outbreak response.

- 4.2 The first outcome indicator, *breadth of protection (S1.1)*, is defined as average coverage of all recommended Gavi-supported vaccines provided through routine immunisation, which was also used in Gavi 4.0.

- 4.3 Additional indicators have been identified to complement monitoring of *breadth of protection*. These key “drivers” of breadth of protection are: 1) coverage of Gavi-supported vaccines (SDG 3.b.1 indicators); 2) number of new introductions; 3) rate of coverage scale up of newly introduced vaccines; and 4) use of robust evidence to inform in-country decisions on vaccine priorities (i.e. **Strategic Objective 1A**).

- 4.4 The second outcome indicator, *measles campaign reach (S1.2)*, measures the ability of Gavi-supported preventive campaigns to reach children previously unvaccinated for measles. Preventive campaigns are most effective and efficient if they reach unprotected individuals to close immunity gaps. Measles has been selected due to ongoing measurement efforts to assess campaign reach, and the high coverage threshold required for herd immunity. The indicator is defined as the proportion of MCV zero-dose children targeted by a campaign that are reached by the campaign, and would be measured through post campaign coverage surveys.

- 4.5 The third outcome indicator, *timely response to outbreak response requests (S1.3)* measures the efficiency of the International Coordination Group (ICG) on vaccine provision and Measles & Rubella Initiative (M&RI) mechanisms in responding to vaccine preventable disease outbreaks in Gavi supported countries. The indicator can be disaggregated into separate steps, including the timely review, approval and shipment of vaccine doses. Monitoring the efficiency of the stockpile and outbreak response

mechanisms will enable the Alliance to systematically identify specific bottlenecks and identify solutions. Concerns with this proposal are that it does not reflect progress of country programmes in terms of learning from outbreak response, e.g. through root cause analysis with follow up action, or the effectiveness of the outbreak response.

5. SG2 – Strengthen health systems to increase equity in immunisation

- 5.1 Strategic Goal 2 (SG2) aims to strengthen health systems to increase equity in immunisation. Measurement of progress on SG2 is linked to the mission indicator on reaching *zero-dose children (M4)* and bringing them into the routine immunisation system (Strategic Objective 2A) through strengthening subnational efforts to improve equity by supporting countries to improve the supply (Strategic Objective 2B) and demand side of immunisation services including addressing gender-related barriers (Strategic Objective 2C).
- 5.2 The first outcome indicator, *additional children reached beyond the first dose of DTP (S2.1)*, measures progress towards ensuring that zero-dose children are brought into the immunisation system so they are on the pathway to being fully immunised. The TWG is discussing different options:
- a) Focus on DTP3 (the current definition of “under-immunised”), potentially alongside MCV1.
 - b) Or, a composite indicator measuring the co-coverage of DTP3 and MCV, reflecting the proportion of children receiving immunisation touchpoints at 6, 10, 14 weeks and 9 months.
- 5.3 A second outcome indicator, *geographic equity of zero-dose (S2.2)*, is being discussed by the TWG and the IA2030 M&E Taskforce. Data quality challenges in monitoring subnational coverage for the GVAP 90-80 target must be taken into account. An indicator to measure progress on subnational equity would be valuable given the key role of subnational targeting to reach zero-dose children and communities. The PPC noted that geographic equity beyond zero-dose would also be of interest.
- 5.4 The PPC inquired about including other outcome indicators for equity, e.g., DTP3 coverage by wealth quintile. These indicators should be monitored, but are not proposed as strategy indicators given their reliance on infrequent household surveys; a lesson learned from 4.0 monitoring. Evidence also suggests that being zero-dose is correlated with other inequalities.
- 5.5 Indicators for Strategic Objectives 2B and 2C are pending final development of programmatic approaches, and will be aligned with the Gender Policy (see Doc 07 to 24-25 June 2020 Board meeting). As countries implement activities tailored to address their local supply and demand-side barriers to immunisation, it may be difficult to define portfolio-level outcome indicators for all elements within Strategic Objectives 2B and 2C. **Process or output measures are anticipated** for some of these indicators, which would be sensitive to near-term progress. The PPC highlighted the importance of

including indicators on supply chain, data, gender-related barriers, and integration into primary health care.

6. SG4 – Ensure healthy markets for vaccines and related products

6.1 Under Strategy Goal 4 (SG4), Gavi aims to continue to ensure healthy markets for vaccines and immunisation-related products. Measurement of SG4 will rely on three outcomes indicators, one for each strategic objective.

6.2 *Number of markets exhibiting sufficient supply dynamics (S4.1)*. Monitoring healthy market dynamics will reflect the aggregate status of Gavi-supported vaccine and cold chain equipment markets. Each market will be measured along two dimensions: 1) whether market health is sufficient or requires improvement and 2) whether conditions exist to enable necessary improvements in market health, if required.

6.3 *Number of innovative products within the pipeline of commercial-scale manufacturers (S4.2)*. Uptake of innovative products, including those in VIPS (Vaccine Innovation Prioritisation Strategy), by commercial manufacturers measures the effectiveness of Gavi's interventions to increase market attractiveness for manufacturers to invest in the commercialisation and production of new innovations.

6.4 *Number of vaccine and immunisation-related products with improved characteristics procured (S4.3)*. "Scale up" of improved vaccine products will be measured via a proxy indicator - the number of improved products newly procured by Gavi. Procurement is a key tool to incentivise innovation, leading to increased use of improved products across countries.

7. Next steps

7.1 The Secretariat will continue consultations with stakeholders to develop most outstanding strategy indicators for Decision at the October 2020 PPC and December 2020 Board, working with the IA2030 M&E Taskforce.

7.2 This work will include developing approaches to target setting, so that as data become available targets can be presented to the Board in June 2021.

7.3 We will develop potential indicators for monitoring Gavi's response to COVID-19, and how to incorporate them into Gavi 5.0 monitoring.

Section C: Actions requested of the Board

The Gavi Alliance Board is requested to **provide guidance** on the Gavi 5.0 measurement framework, including:

- 1) Are extended timelines for finalising the 5.0 measurement framework appropriate?
- 2) Are the proposed mission indicators sufficient to meet the needs for monitoring and communicating progress towards Gavi's impact?

- 3) For strategic objectives where indicators have been developed, are there any areas of measurement that are missing, unnecessary, or should be approached differently?

Annexes

Annex A: Gavi 5.0 strategy framework (i.e. 'one-pager')

Annex B: Summary view of Gavi 5.0 strategy performance indicators

Annex C: Summary description of indicator definitions and proposed use cases

Additional information available on BoardEffect

Appendix 1: Draft performance indicator reference sheets